



Airport Noise Advisory Committee

Date / time 8/17/2016 4:00 PM

Meeting called to order by: Heidi Gantwerk

In Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>	<u>In Attendance</u>
Captain (Ret.) Jack Bewley	Airline Pilot (Retired)	No
Emmet Aquino	County of San Diego	No*
Lee Steuer	Representative for Congresswoman Susan Davis	Yes
Conrad Wear	Representative for San Diego City Councilwoman Lorie Zapf	Yes
Carl "Rick" Huenefeld	MCRD	Yes
Susan Ranft	Downtown Community Planning Council	Yes
Kirk Hansen (represented by: Robert Bates)	Community at Large	Yes
David Swarens	Greater Golden Hill Community Planning Committee	No*
Deborah Watkins	Mission Beach Precise Planning Board	Yes
Paul Webb	Peninsula Community Planning Board	Yes
Tom Gawronski	Ocean Beach Planning Board	No*
Victoria White	City of San Diego, Planning Department	Yes
Rick Savage	FAA	Yes
Barry Davis	FAA	Yes
Robert Cook	FAA	Yes
Andrea Ortega	FAA	Yes
Brian Elliott	Representative for Congressman Scott Peters	Yes
Chris Cole	Uptown Planners	Yes
Justin Cook	Acoustical Engineer	Yes
Grady Boyce	Commercial Airline Pilot Representative	No*
Victor Avina	Representative for San Diego County Supervisor Greg Cox	Yes
Randall LaRocco	Midway/Pacific Highway Community Planning Board	Yes
Authority Staff	Keith Wilschetz, Sjohnna Knack, Craig Mayer	
Heidi Gantwerk	Facilitator	

1. Welcome and Introductions

Heidi Gantwerk, facilitator for the Airport Noise Advisory Committee (ANAC), opened the meeting at 4:01 pm. The meeting began with a brief overview of the agenda and the process. Ms. Gantwerk explained the minutes are provided in a summary format rather than verbatim style. ANAC members introduced themselves.

2. Policy Updates

Ms. Gantwerk defined three policy updates previously approved by the Board. First: Ms. Watkins, whose role was ex-officio on the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board, is now a voting Board member. Second: there is an addition of a general community group member position on ANAC, whose role has voting privileges and will represent a community group with a focus on noise issues. The Committee will vote on the general community member today. The last policy change is that a new 15-member subcommittee will be created; final member selections will be made in September. Ms. Gantwerk noted that nine (9) applications have been submitted, and she encouraged others to apply. This subcommittee comprised of public members who, starting next month, will work with staff, FAA and other industry members. At the first subcommittee meeting, members will create a one-year work plan on what issues will be discussed, and bring it back to ANAC in October for approval. Ms. Gantwerk stated that ANAC will appoint a subcommittee chair, who will be both a member of ANAC and the subcommittee at today's meeting.

3. New Business

Ms. Gantwerk took agenda item 6, New Business, out of order so that the new community member could present before the committee. Bruce Bailey introduced himself as representative of the community group, San Diego Air Route Forum. Mr. Bailey talked about his group and their interest in serving ANAC. The San Diego Air Route Forum meets monthly and has been involved with analyzing community issues since September 2015. They were previously known as Point Loma Steering Committee and are recognized by the state as a legitimate community group. Group members include: Casey Schnoor, Melissa Hernholm-Danzo, Julie Connolly, Sandy Purdon, Jill Monroe, Russ Valone, Matt Spathas, Neal Esterly, Alan Harris and Joe Watkins from PLNU. Mr. Bailey recommended Point Loma native Melissa Hernholm-Danzo the ANAC representative for the community group.

Questions from ANAC: Ms. Watkins requested to review minutes and by-laws.

Ms. Knack confirmed the by-laws and member list have been reviewed and are acceptable.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Huenefeld asked for their mission statement to confirm no overlap in representation.

Mr. Bailey stated that their mission as involved citizens of the public focuses on the environment and could offer feedback on pollution, jet engines, noise, and other current issues. As each community have their own concerns, he felt that there would be no overlap in representation, and believes the group will be a positive influence. Mr. Bailey endorsed Melissa Hernholm-Danzo as their group representative.

Ms. White motioned to recommend Melissa Hernholm-Danzo as the representing member of San Diego Air Route Forum. Mr. Huenefeld seconded the motion. Ms. Ranft abstained. Motion was approved. Mr. Bailey was seated at the ANAC table with the rest of the members for the remainder of the meeting.

Ms. Gantwerk asked for volunteers to Chair the subcommittee. Hearing no volunteers, she stated they will table the ANAC subcommittee chair vote for the next meeting.

4. Presentation Items

Note: A copy of the information in the presentation can be found via our website using the following link:

http://www.san.org/Airport-Noise/Initiatives?EntryId=8892&Command=Core_Download

Quieter Home Program Update - Craig Mayer, Deputy Program Manager, Quieter Home Program (Program), provided an update on the program status.

Mr. Mayer stated there are currently 652 applicants, or 1,396 individual units on the waitlist. During the months of June and July, 45 homes were completed. The program estimates that 136 units will be completed by end of calendar year 2016. Through July 31, 2016 there have been 3,444 units completed.

The Program continues to work with local FAA representation to resolve challenges of delaying future projects. There is a meeting scheduled with the LA District Office FAA representative next Thursday to discuss Program changes, contract documents and administrative changes.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Bates requested the estimation of next year's complete number? Mr. Bates asked if the delays have been a result of the FAA policy changes.

Mr. Mayer responded that in the past years, the Program has completed between 300-350 units. The Program hopes to return to those numbers. Mr. Mayer confirmed the FAA policy changes are result of delays.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. LaRocco inquired if building materials, quality or cost will be reduced or revised? Will there be heating and ventilation changes? Or costs to homeowner?

Mr. Mayer responded that there is no intention to change quality of products. He affirmed there will be changes on ventilation scope, as well as potential revisions to mechanical and electrical scope of work.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Webb requested that Mr. Mayer outline the scope of work and how that might affect Quieter Home Program participants.

Mr. Mayer reviewed the Quieter Home Program process: windows, doors, and source of ventilation. He stated there is ongoing discussion with the FAA to determine the definition of an acceptable ventilation system. The ventilation system scope may change, as well as electrical work that is necessary to support the ventilation.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Webb suggested the FAA will not pay for work the FAA doesn't consider necessary.

Mr. Mayer responded that is correct; the FAA will not pay for ineligible work.

Curfew Violation Review Panel (CVRP) Statistics – Sjohnna Knack, Program Manager, Airport Planning and Noise Mitigation, gave a review of the curfew violations. There were 20 violations in June and July, which is an increase of seven (7) violations from this time last year. The airport has received many complaints regarding curfew violations from British Airways, which has had six (6) violations since they started flying their Boeing 747 in March of 2016. If British Airways has any further curfew violations between today and January 1, 2017, each violation could be assessed a penalty of \$30,000. There is a one-on-one meeting scheduled with British Airways next week to specifically talk about their violations.

In July, there were four (4) violations related to Comic-Con. Two (2) violations were from private jets, and two (2) violations from air carriers who had nowhere to put up passengers, as hotels were sold out due to Comic-Con.

Staff worked with Signature Aviation (Fixed Base Operator) prior to the All-Star Game, and developed literature to encourage pilots to fly quietly and to remind them of the curfew. There were no curfew violations as a result of the All-Star game.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Webb asked why the numbers of curfew violations exceed those from previous years.

Ms. Knack responded that there is no single reason for this, as the airport is witnessing ebbs and flows this year. British Airways and Air Canada are the airlines with most violations. Staff met with Air Canada. Their seasonal flight which ends in October had five (5) violations and once it goes on hiatus will level out the numbers.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Webb requested that staff meet with British Airways, and also asked if there is a way to tweak the British Airways schedule to avoid future curfew violations?

Ms. Knack stated that they will discuss this topic, as well as their aircraft type when they meet. They are encouraging British Airways to return to the B777, as previously there was not a curfew issue with the B777. However, the flights are consistently full, and this is the reason British Airways changed to larger B747s.

Questions from ANAC: Ms. Watkins stated her concern as curfews and overruns fly over Mission Beach. She inquired if staff is following up with these issues?

Ms. Knack stated that staff works on reviews from multiple data sources regarding the 11:30 PM to 6:30 AM curfew. Ms. Knack explained that as San Diego International Airport is a public airport, they cannot restrict planes from flying, but instructs them of the curfew. Ms. Knack went through the process of alerting airlines of their violation, and the research staff conducts to present to the Curfew Violation Review Panel (CVRP) so that they can make a decision on whether to penalize or not.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Bates inquired if there ever had been a discussion to lengthen the curfew hours? He stated that in Orange County, their curfew stops at 7:00 am.

Ms. Knack stated that the Airport Authority must abide by the Airport Use Regulation, which is comprehensive. To extend the curfew hours, the Airport Authority would have to conduct a Part 161 Study. This is a comprehensive study, and she believes that no airport has been successful with this study. Ms. Knack introduced Mr. Gene Reindel, from HMMH (Noise Consultants).

Mr. Reindel explained that to modify the Airport Use Restriction, a Part 161 Study is required by the FAA, and there is a possibility that the airport could lose the grandfathered existing curfew. As the SDIA's curfew existed prior to 1990, it was grandfathered; any curfew request after 1990, the inquiring airport is required to conduct a Part 161 Study, which Mr. Reindel believes is highly likely to be unsuccessful.

Mr. Wilschetz stated that they do not want to risk losing the curfew, which could exacerbate noise issues rather than improve them.

Questions from ANAC: Ms. Ranft inquired the names of airports with curfews.

Ms. Knack said that she would research the answer.

Questions from ANAC: Ms. White asked if the FAA is the ultimate decision-maker.

Ms. Knack affirmed the FAA has the ultimate decision to approve changes to the curfew.

Missed Approach - Ms. Knack explained the definition of missed approaches. She clarified that a missed approach is done for safety reasons and cannot be influenced by the Airport Authority. Airplanes that have to turn around will either go over Point Loma or Mission Beach in order to land properly. Ms. Knack specified that contraflow operations are when the airport has to switch the direction of arrival and departure flow. The missed approach numbers are lower for this year, 414, compared to this time last year, 433. 106 of the 160 missed approaches were compliant with the FAA's noise dots. There was one (1) missed approach due to contraflow operations. Only 54 missed approaches in the 60 days did not comply with the FAA noise dots; a small number, compared to the total of 17,907 departures for those two months.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Avina asked Mr. Cook for the definition of inclement weather?

Mr. Cook responded that inclement weather is fog, rain, and cloud cover.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Cole referenced the State of California Quarterly Report for 2016, 1st quarter, that the QNR Table 3 on page 4 references that air taxis had a 54% decrease from 2015. He asked for the definition of air taxis.

Mr. Wilschetz stated the an air taxi is an aircraft less than 60 seats or 18,000 pounds or less and that the trend is going toward bigger planes. He indicated there are fewer flights as a result, but larger aircraft.

Early Turns - Ms. Knack explained the definition of an early turn. Airport Staff is meeting with all airlines and their Chief Pilots to educate them on the noise concerns and statistics in the communities surrounding the Airport. Ms. Knack indicated that she hoped by continually meeting with the carriers, early turns might be reduced.

Ms. Knack reported that early turns left over Point Loma in June totaled 29 early turns and in July totaled 13, for a total of 42. She noted that there were 294 departures a day, 42 for both months, which equals less than one early turn a day. To the right, over Mission Beach, the number was higher, 57 early turns for June and July, still less than one a day.

Questions from ANAC: Ms. Watkins indicated that there are 165 more early turns over Mission Beach than Point Loma. She indicated she would like to represent as Chair of the ANAC Subcommittee.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Bates inquired the reason for initiating an early turn, and if the FAA Air Traffic Control initiated this? He asked if pilots initiate a request for early turn?

Mr. Cook responded that early turns are due to traffic, safety and weather.

Noise Complaints Statistics - Ms. Knack reported that in April and May, there are more complaints from more households. Currently, staff is receiving complaints from 204 households. The reasons for complaints are that aircraft are too low, too loud, the path has changed, and curfew violations.

Questions from ANAC: Mr. Webb asked that 86% of the complaints were not correlated to a flight was correct on the presentation?

Ms. Knack explained that 90% of complaints are received by email, and as the community uses various apps, typically the disturbance time they register does not correlate to a flight. Disturbance times might be slightly off; however, each complaint is valid, regardless if it is correlated in the system with an aircraft.

Questions from ANAC: Ms. White indicated that this is helpful information to the community, as the methods used to collect data by the current means is not sufficient for what that the airport office needs. Ms. White stated that there needs to be a better indicator, a way to record these incidences accurately to help identify causes.

Ms. Knack said that staff is reviewing different options.

Metroplex Update - Ms. Knack stated the FAA meets on a monthly basis with the airports in Southern California. The FAA's environmental assessment was due out in August; however, given the high number of public comment responses, the FAA is anticipating a release in September. She explained there will be four (4) implementation dates of the 180 procedures: in November, January, March, and April. The first release for San Diego will be in November. The FAA has committed to public engagement through their website, written notice, and public workshops prior to release of procedures.

5. Public Comment

Ms. Gantwerk opened the public comment period. She reminded the public that each speaker would have three (3) minutes to speak and would not be able to go over the allotted time, to ensure all speakers get an opportunity. She reminded speakers to obtain a request card and write out their comments on the card.

Neal Esterly inquired if early turns are still using 6,000 feet as criteria? Is each complaint logged in as one complaint? What is being done with the funds of curfew violations? Does it go in the general fund? Can this money be loaned to Quieter Home Program? Mr. Esterly referenced an article about airlines purchasing old jets. He is concerned that older planes burn more fuel and may potentially cause delays due to maintenance issues. He would like to know if the public can control what planes fly over their community.

Russ Valone stated that most homes eligible for the Quieter Home Program are in the 275 departure flight path and Ms. Knack referred to the 265. Mr. Valone requested to see the documents that state where changes occurred. Mr. Valone also requested an audit of WebTrak information on flights departing other than 275 over Ocean Beach and the Pier. His experience is of the flights he sees, which is inconsistent with WebTrak reports.

Joel Young represents Point Loma People for Progress and stated that there are more complaints of the noise level increase. Recently Southwest Airlines and FedEx planes have been flying at the 275 heading, which is an increasing trend of aircraft flying significantly south. He requested clarification if there was a change in the flight path?

Gary Wonacott is the Vice President of the Mission Beach Town Council, and his council is working hard to reduce noise in their neighborhood. After researching historical data, he is concerned that Mission Beach has been underrepresented for decades and believes that there are opportunities for his community, including noise abatement. Mr. Wonacott suggested the key issue is placement of noise

monitors. He was assured from the FAA that from 10:00 p.m. to midnight flights are on the 290 heading, but he still sees some planes on the 293.

Susan Barrill is a 30-year resident of lower Ocean Beach. Ms. Barrill stated she recently adopted a dog, and in June noticed that her pet has been reacting to the flight noise. She is concerned for her health and her pet's, with oncoming Metroplex, believes she will be ignored.

Dr. Lila Schmidt is concerned about pollution exposure by living near airport. Dr. Schmidt purchased her home years ago, away from airport to avoid health hazards of airport, but now flights have shifted toward her home and she believes her health is at risk. She stated that the curfew violations should be charged at a higher rate.

Sandy Valone visited the Quieter Home Program Office and believes that the Program's contour map does not address the southern trajectory. She stated that no one on the ANAC panel has acknowledged that flights are flying south and that planes are quickly turning at and to the pier. Ms. Valone asked for noise monitors.

Michael Winn stated that he purchased his home last October, but that the noise level has changed. Mr. Winn believes the San Diego Airport wasn't planned, and that the airport needs to move as the noise has increased. He offered to be an ethnographer for the community, to document their experience, so everyone could sympathize with the noise issues and work together for a resolution to airport traffic.

Lindy Logan lives between the 265 and 275 heading for many years, and that previously noise was not a problem until this year. She stated that the noise level has increased as well as the jet engine fuel smell. She requested clarification from Mr. Cook regarding the standard: the 265 heading which is indicated in the Scott Peter letters or the 275 heading, which she believes is standard?

Nancy Caine lives in Fleetridge. Ms. Caine requested if staff met with FedEx regarding their early morning flights and what was the outcome? She also stated that Flight Tracker is down often and it is hard to report on specific planes, if Flight Tracker is not operational. She also requested the website location for the committee application.

Responses - Ms. Knack stated that early turns are calculated at any altitude, not only at the 6,000 feet altitude. She requested that the public log complaints in separate emails; if several complaints are on one email, it is considered only one complaint. Ms. Knack acknowledged frustration when Flight Tracker is not operational. Ms. Knack explained that Flight Tracker runs on an FAA data feed, and is subject to outages when the FAA data feed is down. She indicated that the FAA is working to improve it; all historical data is shown on Flight Track when it becomes operational. Ms. Knack clarified that curfew funds go to the Airport Authority's general fund. The subcommittee application is located on the Airport website: www.san.org, Airport Noise, Airport Meetings.

Question from ANAC: Mr. Huenefeld inquired if noise monitors are independently calibrated or by airport staff?

Mr. Cook responded that Bruel & Kjaer, the noise system vendor, annually calibrates the noise monitors.

Question from ANAC: Mr. Huenefeld inquired the cost of a noise monitor?

Ms. Knack explained that a permanent noise site, including procurement, labor and maintenance, is approximately one million dollars per site. As the cost is prohibitive, the Authority limited noise monitor sites to the Title 21 requirements for the noise contour. Ms. Knack stated that if there are changes in flight tracks, the monitors will indicate those changes.

Mr. Justin Cook (ANAC Acoustician) stated that this is correct. It is more cost-efficient to be portable as there are only equipment costs.

Question from ANAC: Mr. Huenefeld said there are concerns that WebTrak has not been correct and wanted to verify that it is coming directly from the FAA feed, and therefore no way to manipulate or change data? He inquired if it is the same feed that the controllers are using to manage air space? Mr. Huenefeld asked if there is a possibility that a person would experience an aircraft differently than what is on WebTrak?

Mr. Davis said he could not answer this question from a technical standpoint; he believes the data does not come directly from the FAA, but rather as a compilation from an east coast company. The feed source is different from what the controllers use.

Question from ANAC: Mr. Cole stated concern that the information on WebTrak is a model, and asked if WebTrak would be accurate at 265 or 275 headings?

Ms. Knack stated that the Noise Office uses multiple data sources, which includes WebTrak, what the public uses, and the data from our airport noise and operation system. There might be a missing flight on WebTrak, but the other data needs to be post-processed with new information; this is not modeled information, but information from the FAA feed. Staff has gone out to validate flights and spent many hours at peak levels on various days and times to research if tracks are valid. They are currently working on analysis to overlay, so they can quantify ANOMS and WebTrak. Airport Authority Board requested that an audit be conducted by the state, which would include our Airport Noise Operations and Monitoring System.

Question from ANAC: Mr. Cole inquired if the community is on track with coordinating complaints with actuality: right airline, right airplane?

Mr. Wilschetz said there are two ways to track a plane: with radar and Flight Tracker, and the other, with a noise monitor. He believes that if one method was off, they would see a discrepancy. He stated that they do not see a discrepancy and is confident with this information. The south half of the peninsula is a unique situation, as there are two airports and cannot discern from which airport the noise originates. Military jets and helicopters are noisier than SDIA aircraft noise; however, it is difficult to tell. Staff has done the research.

Question from ANAC: Mr. Webb stated he was satisfied to hear about the audit and believes that this information will be valuable, as there seems to be a disconnect. He doesn't believe there is a discrepancy between community and WebTrak; however, the audit will help to resolve this.

Ms. Gantwerk inquired if there was an audit timeframe?

Ms. Knack did not have this information on hand.

Ms. Gantwerk reminded audience that answers to previously asked questions are on the website at www.san.org and the Airport Noise email is airnoise@san.org.

6. Information Items

Airport Authority Update – Mr. Keith Wilschetz, Director Airport Planning, gave an update on the activity at the airport for the month of June. July's statistics were not yet available, but Mr. Wilschetz stated that July was full with events, from the All-Star game, Comic-Con and visiting presidential candidates.

Total passengers increased by 1.1% in June, compared with June of 2015. Overall, total passengers have increased by 3.3% for the calendar year.

For Airport Operations, Mr. Wilschetz stated that takeoffs and landings have increased by 2.0% for the month of June. For the calendar year, operations declined by 0.1%. This is due to a decline in Air Taxi operations by -35.8% for the month of June and -47.5% compared to last year (for clarity: The vast majority of flights that operated from the Commuter Terminal fell into the Air Taxi category, these have transitioned to larger aircraft that fall into the Air Carrier category with fewer total daily operations). As a result of this, Air Carrier operations are up 6.0% for June and up 6.7% for the calendar year (for clarity: this Air Carrier growth is expected to level off by the fall as the transition to larger aircraft took place over the Summer of 2015).

The Parking Plaza in front of Terminal 2 started construction. Terminal 2's parking lot is currently closed, but the Airport is working to mitigate Harbor Drive traffic. The Parking Plaza is scheduled to open by late spring of 2018.

7. Approval of Minutes & Subcommittee Chair

Based on Ms. Watkin's earlier mention of volunteering to serve as the Chair of the Subcommittee, Ms. Gantwerk called to motion approval of the June 15, 2016 minutes. Ms. White approved the motion and Ms. Ranft seconded the motion. Mr. Avina corrected that Mr. Cox's Supervisor title. All agreed unanimously.

Ms. White motioned to approve Ms. Watkins as new Subcommittee Chair. Paul Webb seconded. Ms. Watkins was approved without discussion.

8. Next Meeting/Adjourn

The next meeting is scheduled for October 19, 2016 at 4:00 PM at the Administrative Building, 3225 N. Harbor Dr., San Diego, CA. Ms. Cole motioned to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Mr. Webb. The meeting was adjourned at 5:53 pm.