

MEETING SUMMARY

Airport Noise Advisory Committee

Date/Time 10/18/17 4:00 p.m.

Meeting called to order by: Heidi Gantwerk

In Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>	<u>In Attendance</u>
Captain (Ret.) Jack Bewley	Airline Pilot (Retired)	Yes
Jessica Mier	Representative for Congresswoman Susan Davis	No*
Jessica Turner	County of San Diego	Yes
Conrad Wear	Representative for San Diego City Council, District 2	Yes
Carl "Rick" Huenefeld	MCRD	Yes
Susan Ranft	Downtown Community Planning Council	No*
Kirk Hansen	Community at Large	No*
David Swarens	Greater Golden Hill Planning Committee	Yes
Deborah Watkins	Mission Beach Precise Planning Board	Yes
Fred Kosmo	Peninsula Community Planning Board	Yes
Tom Gawronski	Ocean Beach Planning Board	No
Victoria White	City of San Diego, Planning Department	Yes
Richard Sullivan	FAA	Yes
Kiera Galloway	Representative for Congressman Scott Peters	Yes
Chris Cole	Uptown Planners	No*
Justin Cook	Acoustical Engineer	Yes
Grady Boyce	Commercial Airline Pilot Representative	Yes
Danny Melgoza	Representative for San Diego County Supervisor Greg Cox	Yes
Vacant	Midway/Pacific Highway Community Planning Board	No
Melissa Hernholm-Danzo	Peninsula Steering Committee	Yes
Sjohnna Knack	Authority Staff	Yes
Heidi Gantwerk	Facilitator	Yes

*Members contacted staff ahead of time and are considered excused.

1. Welcome and Introductions

Heidi Gantwerk, facilitator for the Airport Noise Advisory Committee (ANAC), opened the meeting at 4:00 p.m. Introductions were made around the table. She explained that the agenda was very full and the topics were very important so requested that public comment be concise, and that any members of the public willing to state their reinforcement of a previously made point would be recognized and recorded. She also requested that members of the public wishing to speak on more than one topic do so within

the three-minute limit if possible. She also explained how the ANAC subcommittee recommendations would be reviewed and how ANAC would determine which recommendations to send on to the Airport Authority Board.

2. Presentation Items

Note: A copy of the presentation and original report can be found via our website using the following link:

<http://www.san.org/Airport-Authority/Meetings-Agendas/ANAC?EntryId=10729>

La Jolla Aircraft Noise and Flight Track Analysis – Paul Dunholter, P.E., BridgeNet International

Mr. Dunholter presented the results from the La Jolla noise measurements and FAA radar analysis. He reminded the audience that at the August meeting he presented the purpose and methodology for the study, which was to obtain a better understanding about potential factors contributing to the increase in noise complaints from the La Jolla community. He stated the study looked at both noise measurement data as well as over one million FAA radar flight tracks from 2014-2017 to determine if there were measurable differences in noise or operational changes in the aircraft flying in and out of San Diego International Airport (SDIA).

He stated that after the August presentation, based on public input, two additional measurement sites were added for longer durations. They also included additional flight procedure departure analysis and a review of the noise complaint locations.

Results indicated that the FAA SoCal Metroplex (Metroplex) procedure shifted the arrival path over La Jolla 1,200 feet to the south (as it crossed over the shoreline); however, the average altitudes after the Metroplex were approximately 150 feet higher. On average altitudes after Metroplex were 8,610 feet above ground level.

Additionally, with the implementation of new satellite-based procedures in 2012, aircraft have followed a more precise and narrower path. In review of the path from 2014 to present, there was a gradual increase in the precision since the procedures were already implemented in 2012.

In reviewing the flight track data it was also noted that after 10:00 p.m. some flights were not following the published procedures and were turning over La Jolla. This was not a frequent occurrence, but a noted concern of La Jolla residents.

Mr. Dunholter explained the noise monitoring results showed that based on La Jolla's location, aircraft noise is generated by over flights from multiple airports. He indicated that generally the SDIA operations were quieter than the other airport operations but started earlier in the morning and went late into the evening. He also emphasized that the flights could have a greater impact on the residents of La Jolla because the ambient noise levels in the community are very low. Pre and post Metroplex noise measurements at UCSD did not show any measurement differences in noise. The UCSD location was selected as it was close to the 1,200 foot shift in the Metroplex procedure. There are other meteorological conditions (i.e., water and humidity) that can also higher SDIA noise.

Finally, Mr. Dunholter explained that additional impacts could be perceived based on the overall increase in SDIA operations. Since 2014, operations have increased approximately 8%. In addition, fleet mix changes from propeller and small regional jets shifted to larger regional jets and narrow body jets that are typically louder.

3. Action Items

ANAC Subcommittee Recommendations

Ms. Gantwerk explained that first she was going to read through the ANAC Subcommittee recommendations prior to public comment. Then after public comment they would discuss the recommendations more in-depth.

4. Public Comment

Ms. Gantwerk reminded the public of the requests she made at the beginning of the meeting to keep comments concise and to avoid repeating statements.

Urs Baumann a resident from La Jolla felt there was data missing from the La Jolla Noise monitoring report and that the locations selected may not accurately represent the issue. He spoke of general concerns about noise in the La Jolla community.

Jim Mittermiller a resident from La Jolla spoke of general concerns about noise in the La Jolla community.

Jan Chatten-Brown a resident from Bird Rock, La Jolla discussed general concerns about noise in the La Jolla community and expressed that she enjoyed the one-click app to lodge her complaints.

Matthew Price representing the La Jolla Town Council spoke strongly in favor of the subcommittee recommendations, and also expressed praise for the La Jolla Noise Monitoring study, which he believed vindicated the aircraft noise concerns expressed by La Jollans.

Cameron Volker a resident from La Jolla Shores expressed her continued concerns regarding aircraft noise in La Jolla.

Martha Gonzalez a resident from La Jolla expressed great frustration with what she described as continuous and extremely loud noise from aircraft that has made her fearful at times, and dramatically reduced her quality of her and her family's life.

Tony Stiegler a resident from La Jolla spoke of the major economic and quality of life impacts to La Jolla due to the significant increase in aircraft noise, which he believes is affecting tourism and economic activity. He also spoke in support of the subcommittee recommendations.

Larry Davidson a resident from La Jolla spoke of general concerns about noise in the La Jolla community.

Bea Pardo a resident from Bird Rock, La Jolla spoke in support of the subcommittee recommendations, and of the need for immediate action.

Gillian Auckland a resident from Bird Rock, La Jolla I think just general frustration with the number, timing and volume of flights, and her feeling that no action is being taken.

Lee Ann Raddatz a resident from Point Loma Heights South said it was her she the one who said it was her first time commenting on aircraft noise, which should be an indication of how significant the problem is. She and her husband just completed a remodel and were shocked by the change in noise since moving back into their home.

Alan Harris a resident from Pacific Beach is a member of the Subcommittee and expressed that he hoped ANAC moves all of their recommendations forward.

Vicki Bodack a resident from South Mission @ Jetty St. stated she was happy that the recommendations are doing something to reduce the noise impacts at her home. She told the public more people should use the flight tracker website as this is how their voices can be heard.

Lila Schmidt a resident from Fleetridge, Pt. Loma spoke in favor of the subcommittee recommendations and expressed concerns about the health risks posed to those living under a flight path, as well as concerns over declining property values and the airlines focus on profit over quality of life.

Len Gross a resident from La Jolla who is an aerospace engineer, expressed gratitude for the work on the La Jolla report. He feels that we should focus efforts on solutions rather than address what happened. He has spent time developing proposed procedure improvements that are included in the recommendations. He hoped ANAC approved those recommendations. He requested a meeting with BridgeNet to go over the details of the La Jolla report.

Julie Connolly a resident from Point Loma she founded the San Diego Air Route Forum on Facebook. She felt it was a big issue that the FAA does not have SoCal TRACON data available, like at LAX and other major airports. She has reached out to the liveatc.net staff and is working with them to try and get SoCal TRACON on their website.

Todd Curry a resident from Del Cerro something changed with the COMIX STAR on 9/1/17 – what happened that he is experiencing something different? He is willing to gather residents to form opposition, unless something is changed to reduce their noise impacts.

Larry Gutafson a resident from Sunset Cliffs talked about the increase in noise and number of flights and its effect on his quality of life, including fear of flights that seemed much lower than in prior years.

Chris McCann a resident from La Jolla spoke in favor of the subcommittee recommendations and the general results of the La Jolla report presented earlier.

Marilyn Jaseniuk a resident from South Mission Beach expressed her concern over the constancy of flights overhead from early in the morning until late and night. She spoke of how the increase in both constancy and volume of airplane noise was impacting her life, and asked that action be taken immediately to address the situation.

ANAC Subcommittee Recommendations (Continued for Discussion)

Before beginning the discussion of the subcommittee recommendations, Ms. Gantwerk thanked the members of the subcommittee for their dedication and thoughtful work. She informed ANAC members that they had the option of tabling specific recommendations if they could not get through all of them at once. She explained that they would take the recommendations section by section, and would take a vote on each section, and specific recommendations as needed. She introduced Grady Boyce, and airline representative with expertise in procedure development and members of the subcommittee, Sandy Valone, Chris McCann and Casey Schnorr who would be available to address any questions that arose. And she explained that Richard Sullivan, the FAA representative, had assured the Airport Authority that the FAA would be fully engaged in reviewing these recommendations, however due to pending litigation, he would not be able to comment on the merits or feasibility of any procedural changes during the ANAC discussion.

Final version of the recommendations can be found: <http://www.san.org/Airport-Authority/Meetings-Agendas/ANAC?EntryId=10729>

Recommendations #1&2 – Curfew Penalties: **Passed** (one opposed).

There was a discussion surrounding the cost of living index and whether that was the appropriate measure to increase penalties. It was also requested that Airport staff review if current penalties were high enough for airlines to avoid curfew violations and if it was necessary to have an increase.

Recommendation #3 – Subcommittee Continuation: **Passed** (4 in favor, 3 opposed, 1 abstain)

There was a substantial discussion about continuing the Subcommittee with some members feeling that the Subcommittee efforts were complete and that implementation of the recommendations was the responsibility of ANAC. Other members felt that the Subcommittee was more effective than ANAC.

Recommendations #4&5 – FAA Air Traffic Control Radio Frequencies: **Passed** (unanimous)

Recommendations #6&7 – ANAC Committee – **Passed** (unanimous)

Recommendations #8&9 – Quieter Home Program – **Passed** (unanimous)

Recommendations #10&11 – Noise Monitoring and Mitigation - **Passed** (unanimous)

A request was made to add Pt. Loma Heights to the list.

Recommendation #12 – Additional SDCRAA Analysis - **Passed** (unanimous)

Recommendation #13 – 21 – Flight Procedure Changes - **Passed** (unanimous)

The members felt that all procedural changes fell under recommendation number 13 and should be pursued as a global approach, rather than individually that they all fell under the overarching review of flight procedures, and would be included for further consideration as examples and suggestions of the kind of procedural changes and outcomes desired.

Recommendation #17 – Nighttime Noise Abatement Procedure - **Passed** (unanimous)

There was a distinction that while reviewing the Nighttime procedure in Item #13 was important, this recommendation should be kept separate to focus on ways to increase adherence to the procedure.

Approval of Minutes:

Approval of June 21, 2017 Minutes

Approval of August 16, 2017 Minutes

These items were not covered in the meeting.

5. Next Meeting/Adjourn

The next meeting is scheduled for December 20th at 4:00 p.m. location to be at Portuguese Hall.